



Child Care at Temple: Today and Tomorrow

Proposal from the Joint TAUP and the
Faculty Senate's Child Care Benefits Committee

May 2018

Committee members: Marsha Weinraub (Chair), Leanne Finnigan, Ariane Fischer, Lindsay Goss, Kim Goyette, Kate Henry, Tonia Hsieh, Rebecca Lloyd, Steve Newman, and Miriam Solomon.

With special thanks to Abbey Bricker, TAUP Staff Organizer, who coordinated meetings, helped with research, collected data, and kept us on schedule.



Executive Summary

The Faculty Senate and TAUP Joint Child Care Committee recommends that this report be submitted for review, consideration, and response from the University in the Fall 2018.

This Committee was formed in response to the TAUP/Temple Contract 2014/2018 item 19 in which it was agreed that “The University understands that TAUP and the Faculty Senate may work to formulate proposals for child care resources at the University. The University shall review, consider, and respond to any proposals in a timely fashion.”

Background: Since the mid-1990’s, when the Temple University Child Care Center at Broad and Masters Streets closed due to hazardous conditions of the building, there has been no child care center on campus for the children of faculty, students, or administrators. College of Education Dean Anderson has informed the Committee that the child care center in the proposed Alpha Center would not accommodate faculty members’ children unless the children were from low-income families in the neighborhoods adjoining Temple University or unfilled slots were available.

Justification for child care benefits: Providing child care at Temple University for faculty member’s children will improve the quality of undergraduate and graduate education, Temple University’s national rankings, and Temple University’s standing as a Research 1 University in four ways—through employee recruitment, employee retention, increased employee availability to students, and increased student and faculty research opportunities.

Offering child care benefits will promote Temple’s ability to compete with “reach”, comparable national, and regional schools in attracting young, productive researchers and scholars to our University. Temple is one of the few universities in our class that does not offer child care benefits. In the fall of 2017, Committee members surveyed child care benefits at large, urban universities, both public and private, from which Temple University recruits prospective faculty and other employees and with which Temple competes in job offers. All three “reach schools” offer child care benefits. Two offer on- or near-campus child care centers for infants through PreK. One does not have an on campus center, but offers a child care subsidy for use at nearby centers. All three schools offer back-up care for center and in-home services when regular care is not available. Of the eleven universities we surveyed in large urban centers across the nation, nine offer child care benefits. Seven provide child care centers for children three years or older, while five of these schools also offer center care for infants and toddlers. Two other schools offer help finding child care and/or child care subsidies. Only two of the 11 comparable schools offer no child care benefits. Of the three comparable regional large urban schools we surveyed, two offer on-site child care centers that serve children from infancy through PreK.

Offering child care benefits will increase faculty availability to students. Because of the high cost of quality child care, many bargaining unit members join co-ops (centers in which parents volunteer hours each month) to reduce the costs, recruit extended family members to provide care, or take time out of their own schedules to reduce the number of required hours of expensive child care. This necessitates faculty members working late nights and early mornings to complete their work. Since this work is not done on campus, faculty members are less available to their students than they might be if regular, affordable care were available and faculty could work in their offices during the daytime on campus. While faculty members often schedule office hours around their child care responsibilities, they are less likely to be working in their offices for students and other faculty members to drop in and chat, resulting in fewer opportunities for student-faculty interaction.

At the same time, child care providers are not always available when they are needed. Some child care centers close for holidays or staff training, and they rarely accept sick children. In-home child care providers (nannies and family day care providers) sometimes get sick and are not available to care for children on random days. Currently, faculty members have a choice—take their children to school with them or cancel classes, meetings, and work travel. Providing back-up care programs would ensure that faculty members, librarians, and academic professionals would never have to cancel meetings or classes due to child care disruptions.

Providing on-site child care would provide on campus access to young children for faculty engaged in research. Currently, faculty members expend considerable costs and energies recruiting pilot subjects for their research, spending hours advertising and contacting individual families one family at a time. Many schools with which Temple competes for external funding can use their centers for collecting pilot data to include in their proposals for external funding and for training undergraduate and graduate student researchers, giving researchers at competing schools an edge in securing external research funding.

A 2018 survey of 266 members of the bargaining unit showed overwhelming support for child care benefits of all types. Strongest support was for on-site campus child care centers for children aged 2 and above (93%), for lactation rooms (93%), and for after school child care (91%). More than 87% of the respondents supported back-up care for school-aged children, and 80% supported back-up care for elderly family members needing care when regular care was not available. The survey also provides evidence that the demand for these services would be manageable and could reasonably be provided by the University.

Proposed child care benefits: We propose that the University consider offering the following benefits for members of the bargaining unit as well as other staff and administrators:

1. A child care center on campus, run by an independent not-for-profit or for profit provider such as Bright Horizons. Temple would provide the space and maintenance for the space, and the contractor would provide all the management, billing, staffing, and curricular functions.

2. Subsidies for families using child care up to 10% of the cost of care. From our survey, we estimate that approximately 100 families at any given time might cost approximately \$150,000.
3. Back-up care for children and elderly. Back up care benefits enable employees to get to work when their regular care arrangements break down. Back up child and elderly care for an institution our size would cost the University approximately \$97,500 annually for a 3 or more year contract term.
4. Lactation rooms easily accessed by employees.

Recommendation: The Committee recommends the formation of a Joint Administration/TAUP Committee as mandated by the TAUP 2014-2019 contract. Members of this TAUP/Faculty Senate Child care committee and representatives from the Temple University Administration to meet together to discuss and explore the proposals described in this report.

Table of Contents

- A. Rationale for this Committee—TAUP/Temple Contract 2014-2019
- B. Child care at Temple today
- C. Why provide child care for bargaining unit members?
- D. Assessment of bargaining unit and membership interest in child care benefits
- E. Child care at Temple tomorrow: Proposed child care benefits
- F. Recommendation

Tables:

- 1: Child Care Benefits at Large Urban Universities
- 2. Bargaining unit responses to Family Care Benefits Survey
- 3. Estimated Back-up Care Costs for Temple

Appendix:

- 2015 Proposal to Develop Child Care Benefits for Dependent Children

The Report

A. Rationale for this committee—TAUP/Temple Contract 2014-2019

The Child Care Committee was formed in response to the TAUP/Temple Contract 2014/2018 item 19 in which it was agreed that “The University understands that TAUP and the Faculty Senate may work to formulate proposals for child care resources at the University. The University shall review, consider, and respond to any proposals in a timely fashion.”

This Committee continues the work of a previous TAUP/Faculty Senate Committee which submitted a proposal in October 2015 for child care benefits. (See Appendix 1.) No action was taken on that set of recommendations due to the renegotiation of the TAUP contract to include adjunct faculty.

This Committee set five tasks for itself. These are to (1) assess the current status of child care at Temple University; (2) identify child care benefits at comparable universities; (3) assess bargaining unit (and membership) interest in child care benefits; (4) explore possible child care benefits for consideration by the University; and (5) propose child care benefits for consideration by the university. We completed all five tasks, and we report our findings in this report.

The Committee recommends that this report be submitted for review, consideration, and response from the University in the Fall 2018.

B. Child care at Temple today

What is the current status of child care at Temple University?

Since the mid-1990’s, when the Temple University Child Care Center at Broad and Masters Streets closed due to hazardous conditions of the building, there has been no child care center on campus for the children of faculty, students, or administrators. Dr. Greg Anderson, Dean of the School of Education, has proposed a PreK Initiative Center, part of the proposed Alpha Center, designed to increase school readiness skills in neighborhood children from low-income families. He has informed the University and this Committee on numerous occasions that his proposed center would not accommodate faculty members’ children unless the children were from low-income families in the neighborhoods adjoining Temple University or unfilled slots were available.

Like many other universities and employers, Temple provides faculty, staff, and administrators the opportunity to participate in Flexible Spending Accounts. Faculty can place up to \$5000 if married and filing jointly or \$2500 if filing separately in pre-tax accounts to be used for child care costs.

C. Why provide child care at Temple University for bargaining unit members' children?

Providing child care at Temple University for bargaining unit member's children will help to improve the quality of undergraduate and graduate education, Temple University's national rankings, and Temple University's standing as a Research 1 University in four ways—through employee recruitment, employee retention, increased faculty availability to students, and increased student and faculty research opportunities.

Employee recruitment. Faculty productivity is a critical factor in raising rankings nationally and maintaining Research 1 status, and faculty recruitment is one means of achieving increased faculty productivity. While Temple may offer competitive tenure track faculty salaries and health benefits, it does not offer any meaningful child care benefits. Support for child care is one of the benefits that is important to productive young researchers and scholars. These individuals are not only embarking on careers, but are also in the stage of life when many are starting families.

Temple is one of the few universities in our class that does not offer child care benefits. In the Fall of 2017, Committee members surveyed child care benefits at large, urban universities, both public and private, from which Temple University recruits prospective faculty and with which Temple competes in job offers. We surveyed three “reach schools” (University of Pennsylvania, Columbia University, and Johns Hopkins University), 11 large urban universities that have similar rankings to Temple (including the University of Maryland, Ohio State, Rutgers-New Brunswick, see Table 1 for a full list), and three large regional competitors (Drexel University, University of Pittsburgh, and Carnegie Mellon University). For a summary of results of this survey, see Table 1.

All three “reach” schools offer child care benefits. Two offer on-or near-campus child care centers for children from infancy through PreK. One (Columbia University) does not have an on-campus center, but offers a child care subsidy for use at nearby child care centers. All three schools offer back-up child care for center and in-home services.

Of the eleven universities in large urban centers across the nation, nine offer child care benefits. Seven provide child care centers on or near campus for children three years or older, while five of these schools also offer center care for infants and toddlers. Two other schools – George Washington and NYU-- offer help with finding child care and child care subsidies. GW has a "Wellbeing Hotline" that provides personalized assistance with matters such as finding childcare and provides 20 spots (Priority Access) at the Bright Horizons where faculty members can get 20% off their tuition. There is also a 10% discount at KinderCare Learning Centers. NYU offers child care referrals, and it also has a Child Care Scholarship Program that assists with the cost of child care and is available to eligible full-time faculty, administrators, and professional research staff applicants at New York University. (There is also a separate subsidy fund program for office and technical staff.) Award amounts are based on the number of eligible applications

received and vary from year to year; generally, scholarships awarded over the past three calendar years ranged from \$1,000 to \$4,000. Only two schools in our survey— CUNY and U Mass Boston-- offer no child care benefits.

Of the three regional schools we surveyed, two – University of Pittsburgh and Carnegie Mellon-- offer on-site child care centers that serve children from infancy through PreK. Drexel University does not offer child care benefits to faculty members.

Offering child care benefits is important if Temple is to compete with “reach”, national and regional schools to attract young, productive researchers and scholars to our University.

Employee retention. Child care is expensive; many faculty, librarians, and academic professionals are not able to afford quality care. Consider this: The 2014-2019 TAUP contract indicates 2016 minima salaries for non-tenure track Associate Professors to be \$54,600, for L3 Librarians, \$45,650, and L17 (highest level) academic professionals to be \$46,319. Yet, in the Philadelphia region, the annual full time cost for center child care for one infant averages \$21,000 and for one PreK child about \$16,000. These costs are well out-of-range for most of our employees.

We do not yet have data from department chairs as to how many faculty members, librarians, or academic professionals of child-bearing age have either not accepted job offers or have vacated their jobs, because of the high cost of quality child care. However, in the summer after our last report (2015), two members of this child care joint committee with working spouses left their jobs partially due to the lack of high quality, affordable child care. A number of bargaining unit members have reached out to this Committee urging us to agitate for child care benefits because they don't see how they can continue working at Temple without at least some support for child care.

In a 2017 article in the Chronicle, Mario Wagner provided evidence that child care supports are needed to keep academic scientists, both men and women, from leaving academic science. <https://www.chronicle.com/article/Academic-Science-Isn-t/238799>.

Temple faculty members devote considerable time and energy to advertising, interviewing, and recruiting new faculty members. Providing quality affordable child care would help us retain faculty members and save recruitment costs.

Increasing employee availability to students. Because of the high cost of quality child care, many bargaining unit members join co-ops (centers in which parents volunteer hours each month) to reduce the costs, recruit extended family members to provide care, or take time out of their own schedules to reduce the number of required hours of expensive child care. This necessitates faculty members working late nights and early mornings to complete their work. Since this late-night work is not done on campus, faculty members are less available to their students than they might be if regular, affordable care were available and faculty could work in

their offices during the daytime on campus. Faculty members schedule office hours around their child care responsibilities, but they are less likely to be working in their offices for students and other faculty members to drop in and chat, resulting in fewer opportunities for student-faculty interaction.

At the same time, even quality child care providers are not always available when they are needed. Some child care centers close for holidays or staff training, and they rarely accept sick children. Also, in-home child care providers (nannies and family day care providers) sometimes get sick and are not available to care for children on random days. Currently, faculty members have a choice—take their children to school with them or cancel classes, meetings, and work travel. Providing back-up care programs would ensure that faculty members, librarians, and academic professionals would never have to cancel meetings or classes due to child care disruptions.

Faculty research opportunities. When Temple University had an on-campus child care center from 1970 through the mid-1990's, many faculty members used the center to conduct pilot work for research proposals to submit to NIH, NSF, and NICHD. Faculty members also trained graduate students in data collection at the child care center, and they sent undergraduate students to observe and record children's activities. Current faculty members do not have this opportunity. Instead, they expend considerable costs and energies recruiting pilot subjects for their research, spending hours advertising and contacting individual families one at a time. In contrast, all the schools listed in Table 1 that have child care centers can use their centers for collecting pilot data to include in their proposals for external funding and for training undergraduate and graduate student researchers, giving researchers at competing schools advantages in securing external research funding.

Thus, providing on-site child care or engaging in financial agreements with large scale child care centers would provide much needed support for researchers training students in research and applying for external funding.

D. Assessment of bargaining unit membership interest in child care benefits

Between February and March of this year, members of the TAUP bargaining unit were invited to complete a survey concerning their support for child care benefits in contract negotiations.

There were 266 members of the bargaining unit who responded. Thirty-nine percent of the respondents were tenured or tenure-track faculty, 36% were NTT faculty members, 17% were adjuncts, 6% were librarians, and less than 2% were academic professionals. Fifty-nine percent of respondents identified as female and 37% identified as male.

The results of this survey are presented in Table 2.

These results provide overwhelming support for child care benefits of all types. Strongest support was for on-site campus child care centers for children aged 2 and above (93%), for lactation rooms (93%), and for after school child care (91%). More than 87% of the respondents supported back-up care for school-aged children, and 80% supported back-up care for elderly family members needing care when regular care was not available. (This, despite the fact that back-up care was not defined or explained in the information provided the survey respondents.)

So that the administration could anticipate costs for providing care, we also measured the level of demand for these services in the survey. If available, subsidies for care would be used by 101 respondents, on-campus center care would be used by 75 respondents, after-school care by 67 respondents, back-up child care would be used by 98 respondents, back-up elderly care would be used by 25 respondents, lactation rooms by 40 respondents, and parking spaces for pregnant women would be used by 26 respondents. These results demonstrate that the demand for these services would be manageable and could reasonably be provided by the University.

In sum, our survey showed strong support for child care benefits being included in negotiations despite the fact that many members would themselves not use these benefits. Follow up discussions with some of the respondents indicate that these colleagues see the value of child care in recruitment, retention, and research.

E. Proposed child care benefits

As a result of our research into the benefits offered by other large urban universities and the services available in the Philadelphia region, we believe that benefits for members of the bargaining unit (as well as other staff and administrators) could include:

1. Provision of a child care center on campus, run by an independent not-for-profit or for profit provider such as Bright Horizons. Temple would provide the space and maintenance for the space, and the contractor would provide all the management, billing, staffing, and curricular functions. Bright Horizons is one such corporate contractor [<https://www.brighthorizons.com/about-us>] that provides care to approximately 100 universities nationwide; faculty members using Bright Horizons centers report satisfaction with their level of care. Existing space could be found for the Center. But construction of a 100 child center could be done for under \$2,000,000. Ideally, a donor could be found to lend their name to this enterprise. [A \$1 M gift from Alan and Connie Buerger to the Buerger Early Learning Center at Congregation Rodeph Shalom at 615 Broad Street created a beautiful state of the art center with a capacity for more than 50 children.] If Temple intends to build a new center on campus and/or if the Center is going to be open to our neighbors in North Philadelphia, the administration should establish a dialogue with our neighbors early in the process to see how the Center might meet their needs and to make sure that the design take into account any concerns they express.

2. Provision of subsidies for families using child care up to 10% of the cost of care. To ensure employee availability on campus, employees receiving subsidies would be required to use full

time care (at least 35 hours). From our survey, we estimate that approximately 100 families at any given time might need such a benefit for an annual cost of approximately \$150,000.

3. Provision of back-up care for children and elderly. When employees experience personal and familial pressures—canceled child care, worries about elderly parents and relatives, uncertainty about affording and financing a child’s educational choices--their work is also disrupted. Bright Horizons offers work/life balance solutions that empower employees to cope with these pressures. It provides back-up child care services and elder and adult care resources that provide employees support at home so the employee can focus on work. Back-up care benefits enable employees to get to work when their regular care arrangements break down. Bright Horizons currently has 52 full time service centers and 41 back up clients in higher-ed.

With Bright Horizon’s help, we estimate that back up child and elderly care for an institution our size would cost the University approximately \$97,500 annually for a 3 or more year contract term. Initially the contract would be written for 70% of estimated use to allow the program to "ramp-up". In Table 3, we present numbers that reflect a mature program at Temple.

4. See this [provision](#), as required by federal law. For what other universities are doing, and for understanding the benefits to students, faculty, and administrators, see [here](#).

F. Recommendation

The Committee recommends the formation of a Joint Administration/TAUP Committee as mandated by the TAUP 2014-2019 contract. Members of this TAUP/Faculty Senate Child care committee and representatives from the Temple University Administration to meet together to discuss and explore the proposals described in this report.

Tables:

- 1: Child Care Benefits at Large Urban Universities
2. Bargaining unit responses to Family Care Benefits Survey
3. Estimated Back-up Care Costs for Temple

Table 1: Child Care Benefits at Large Urban Universities

University	Child Care Center on or near campus?	Research allowed at Center?	Subsidy for off campus child care?	Back up care?
REACH SCHOOLS				
University of Pennsylvania	Y	unknown	-	Y
Johns Hopkins University	Y	Y	-	Y
Columbia University	-	-	Y	Y
ACROSS THE NATION				
University of Delaware	Y	Y	-	
Rutgers University (NB)	Y	Y	-	
University of Maryland	Y	Y	-	
Ohio State University	Y	Y	-	
U of Wisconsin Milwaukee	Y	Y	-	Y
U Illinois Chicago (UIC)	Y	Y	-	
University of Houston	Y	Y	-	
New York University (NYU)	-	-	Y	Y
George Washington U	Y*	-	Y	
CUNY	-	-	-	
Univ Mass Boston	-	-	-	
PENNSYLVANIA				
University of Pittsburgh	Y	Y		
Carnegie Mellon U	Y	Y		
Drexel	-	-	-	
*Offers Priority Access through Bright Horizons				

Table 2: Bargaining unit members support for and interest in using child care benefits (information from 2018 bargaining unit survey (n = 266))

Benefit	Percent in support	Number of individuals who said they would use if available
On campus child care center for children as young as 6 weeks	87%	62
On campus child care center for children starting from 2 years of age	93%	75
On campus after school care for school-aged children (3-6 PM)	91%	67
Subsidy for off-site child care	82%	101
Back-up child care when regular care is not available	87%	98
Lactation/nursing room	93%	40
Parking spaces reserved for pregnant women	78%	26
Back-up elderly care when regular care is not available	80%	25

Table 3. Estimated Back-up Care Costs for Temple

The Bright Horizons' Pricing Calculator/Algorithms considers historical and current demand/use data for their Higher-Ed clients. Initially the contract would be written for 70% of estimated use to allow the program to "ramp-up". The numbers below reflect a mature program for/at Temple.

Annual Program Cost: \$97,500 (for 3 year or more year contract term)

\$102,375 (less than three year contract term)

One-Time Program Implementation Cost: \$5,000.00

Program Parameters:

300 Annual Uses - program level

10 Annual Uses - per-employee

Note: One (1) use = One (1) Day of Care at a Child Care Center (children only) or up to Ten (10) hours of In-Home Care (children and adults).

Employee Co-Pays:

- \$15 per-day for *Center Based* care / \$25.00 per-family (more than one child)

Note: If an employee brings three (3) children to a center the co-pay is only \$25.00 total for all three children. However, it would count as three (3) uses against the employees annual use allotment.

- \$6.00 per-hour for *In-Home* care for up to three (3) children.

Note: Minimum of four (4) hours and max of ten (10) hours.

Miscellaneous:

Employee's annual use allotment can be used for any combination of uses

- *Center Based* child care
- *In-Home* child care
- *In-Home* adult care

Appendix: 2015 Proposal to Develop Child Care Benefits for Dependent Children